

PAUL, WEISS, RIFKIND, WHARTON & GARRISON LLP

1285 AVENUE OF THE AMERICAS
NEW YORK, NEW YORK 10019-6064

TELEPHONE (212) 373-3000

LLOYD K. GARRISON (1946-1991)
RANDOLPH E. PAUL (1946-1956)
SIMON H. RIFKIND (1950-1995)
LOUIS S. WEISS (1927-1950)
JOHN F. WHARTON (1927-1977)UNIT 5201, FORTUNE FINANCIAL CENTER
5 DONGSANHUAN ZHONGLU
CHAOYANG DISTRICT, BEIJING 100020, CHINA
TELEPHONE (86-10) 5828-6300SUITES 3601 - 3606 & 3610
36/F, GLOUCESTER TOWER
THE LANDMARK
15 QUEEN'S ROAD, CENTRAL
HONG KONG
TELEPHONE (852) 2846-0300

WRITER'S DIRECT DIAL NUMBER

(212) 373-3441

WRITER'S DIRECT FACSIMILE

(212) 492-0441

WRITER'S DIRECT E-MAIL ADDRESS

glaufuer@paulweiss.com

ALDER CASTLE
10 NOBLE STREET
LONDON EC2V 7JU, UNITED KINGDOM
TELEPHONE (44 20) 7367 1600FUKOKU SEIMEI BUILDING
2-2 UCHISAIWAICHO 2-CHOME
CHIYODA-KU, TOKYO 100-0011, JAPAN
TELEPHONE (81-3) 3597-8101TORONTO-DOMINION CENTRE
77 KING STREET WEST, SUITE 3100
PO. BOX 226
TORONTO, ONTARIO M5K 1J3
TELEPHONE (416) 504-05202001 K STREET, NW
WASHINGTON, DC 20006-1047
TELEPHONE (202) 223-7300500 DELAWARE AVENUE, SUITE 200
POST OFFICE BOX 32
WILMINGTON, DE 19899-0032
TELEPHONE (302) 655-4410

February 5, 2021

Via ECF and Courier

The Honorable William H. Pauley III
 Daniel Patrick Moynihan
 United States Courthouse
 500 Pearl Street, Room 1920
 New York, NY 10007

MATTHEW W. ABBOTT
 EDWARD T. ACKERMAN
 JACOB A. ADLERSTEIN
 JUSTIN ANDERSON
 ALAIN A. APFEL
 JONATHAN H. ASHTOR
 ROBERT A. ATKINS
 SCOTT A. BARSHAY
 PAUL M. BASTA
 J. STEVEN BAUGHMAN
 LYNN B. BAYARD
 CRAIG B. BENJAMIN
 MARK S. BERGMAN
 DAVID M. BERNICK
 JOSEPH J. BIAL
 BRUCE BIRENBOIM
 H. CHRISTOPHER BOEHNING
 BRIAN BOLIN
 ANGELO BONVINO
 ROBERT BOTTON
 DAVID W. BROWN
 WALTER BROWN**
 SUSANNA M. BUELGER
 JESSICA S. CAREY
 DAVID CARMONA
 GEOFFREY R. CEPPIGA
 ELIZABETH CHENG
 WILLIAM C. CLAREMAN
 LEWIS R. CLAYTON
 YAHONNES CLEARY
 RACHAEL G. COFFEY
 JAY COHEN
 KELLEY A. CORNISH
 CHRISTOPHER C. CROMMINGS
 THOMAS V. DE LA BASTIDE III
 MEREDITH DEARBORN**
 ARIEL J. DECKELBAUM
 KAREN L. DUNN
 ALICE BELISLE EATON
 ANDREW J. EHRLICH
 GREGORY A. EZRING
 ROSS A. FALCON
 ANDREW C. FINGER
 BRAD J. FINKELSTEIN
 BRIAN P. FINNEGAN
 ROBERTO FINZI
 PETER E. FISCH
 HARRIS FISCHMAN
 ANDREW E. FOLEY
 ANDREW J. FORDAN*
 VICTORIA S. FORRESTER
 HARRIS B. FREIDUS
 CHRISTOPHER D. FREY
 MANUEL S. FREY
 ANDREW L. GAINES
 KENNETH A. GALLO
 MICHAEL E. GERTZMAN
 ADAM J. GIVATZ
 SALVATORE GOGLIOMELLA
 NEIL GOLDMAN
 MATTHEW B. GOLDSTEIN
 ROBERTO J. GONZALEZ*
 CATHERINE L. GOODLAD
 CHARLES H. GOODE, JR.
 ANDREW G. GORDON
 BRIAN S. GRIEVE
 UDI GROFMAN
 NICHOLAS GROOMBRIDGE
 BRUCE A. GUTENPLAN
 MELINDA HAAG*
 ALAN S. HALPERIN
 CLAUDIA HANFELD
 BRIAN J. HERRMAN
 MICHELE HIRSHMAN
 JARRETT R. HOFFMAN
 ROBERT E. HOLO
 DAVID S. HUNTINGTON
 AMRAN HUSSEIN
 LORETTA A. IPPOLITO
 WILLIAM A. JACOBSON*
 JAREN JAHGORBANI
 BRIAN M. JANSON
 JEH C. JOHNSON
 BRAD S. KARP
 PATRICK N. KARNSITZ
 JOHN C. KENNEDY
 BRIAN KIM

KYLE J. KIMPLER
 ALEXIA D. KORBERG
 ALAN W. KORNBERG
 DANIEL J. KRAMER
 CAROLYN KUSHNER
 DAVID K. LAKHDIR
 GREGORY F. LAUFER
 BRIAN C. LAVIN
 XIAOYU GREG LIU
 RANDY LUSKEY**
 LORETTA E. LUNCH
 JEAN TREVOR MARELL
 MARINA V. MASOTTI
 DAVID W. MAYO
 ELIZABETH R. MCCOLM
 JEAN M. MCLOUGHLIN
 ALVARO MEMBRILLERA
 MARK F. MENDELSON
 CLAUDETTE MEREDITH-GOUJON
 WILLIAM B. MIGUEL
 JUDIE NG SHORTELL*
 CATHERINE NYARADY
 JANE B. O'BRIEN
 ALEX YOUNG K. OH
 BRAD R. OKUN
 LINDSAY B. PARKS
 ANDREW M. PARKEN
 DANIELLE L. PINEHALL
 CHARLES J. PESANT
 JESSICA E. PHILLIPS*
 VALERIE E. RADWANER
 JEFFREY R. RECHER
 CAROL L. REISNER
 LORIN A. REITER
 JEANNIE S. RHEE*
 WALTER J. RICCIARDI
 WALTER RIEMAN
 RICHARD A. ROSEN
 ANDREW N. ROSENBERG
 JUSTIN ROSENBERG
 JACQUELINE P. RUBIN
 CHRISTOPHER J. RULE*
 RAPHAEL M. RUSSO
 ELIZABETH M. SACKSTEDER
 JEFFREY D. SAFERSTEINER
 JEFFREY B. SAMUELS
 KENNETH M. SCHNEIDER
 ROBERT B. SCHUMER
 JOHN M. SCOTT
 BRIAN SCRIBANI
 KYLE J. SCHRIED
 KANNON K. SHANMUGAM*
 CULLEN L. SINCLAIR
 AUDRA J. SOLOWAY
 SCOTT M. SONTAG
 SARAH STASNY
 TANIA M. STEWART
 ERIC ALAN STONE
 AIDAN SYNNOTT
 BRETT TANNENBAUM
 RICHARD C. TARLOWE
 MONICA K. THURMOND
 DANIEL J. TOAL
 LARA C. TRUANO
 CONRAD VAN LOOGERENBERG
 KRISHNA VEERARAGHAVAN
 LIZA M. VELAZQUEZ
 MICHAEL VOGEL
 RAMY J. WAHBEH
 JOHN WEBER
 LAWRENCE G. WEE
 THEODORE V. WILLELS, JR.
 LINDELL J. WIERSMA
 STEVEN J. WILLIAMS
 LAWRENCE I. WITDORCHIC
 AUSTIN WITT
 MARK B. WLAZLO
 ADAM WOLLSTEIN
 JULIA LARVER MASON WOOD
 JEFFREY H. WU
 BETTY YAP*
 JORDAN E. YARETT
 KAYE N. YOSHINO
 TONG YU
 TRACEY A. ZACCONE
 TAURIA M. ZEITZER
 T. ROBERT ZOCHOWSKI, JR.

*NOT ADMITTED TO THE NEW YORK BAR
 **ADMITTED ONLY TO THE CALIFORNIA BAR

Re: *Maribel Baez, et al. v. New York City Housing Authority*,
 No. 13-CV-08916 (WHP) (S.D.N.Y.)

Dear Judge Pauley:

On behalf of Defendant New York City Housing Authority (“NYCHA”), we are submitting this letter in response to Plaintiffs’ February 3, 2021 letter.

Plaintiffs’ letter raises three issues, only one of which—relating to the percentage of units in NYCHA-operated Section 9 public housing developments that have an open leak or mold work order—is an issue the Court asked Plaintiffs to address in their supplemental letter. The other two issues raised in Plaintiffs’ letter—which they have characterized as attempts to “correct two statements made by [NYCHA’s] counsel during oral argument”—not only go beyond the scope of what Your Honor asked for, but also are themselves factually inaccurate and thus warrant a brief response:

First, Plaintiffs rely on certain of the quarterly reports produced by NYCHA as part of its compliance with *Baez* to suggest that NYCHA included information on work orders related to already converted units. This is incorrect. The work orders highlighted

PAUL, WEISS, RIFKIND, WHARTON & GARRISON LLP

The Honorable William H. Pauley III

2

in Exhibit D to Plaintiffs' letter are from the "Ocean Bay Apartments - *Oceanside*," which has *not* converted to PACT, is still operated by NYCHA, and is therefore included in the quarterly reports. The development that *has* converted to PACT is "Ocean Bay Apartments – *Bayside*," which has been excluded from the quarterly reports since its conversion in 2016. These are two entirely separate developments, despite having similar names. Plaintiffs disregarded or overlooked this critical fact in their February 3 letter.

Second, Plaintiffs contend that NYCHA was incorrect to say that "there was no such thing as NYCHA housing funded through Section 8." NYCHA's counsel's statement was accurate, as the record clearly shows. When NYCHA's counsel made that statement, counsel made clear that at the time the *Baez* class was certified, "[t]here was no such thing as people who live in *PACT* because that program simply did not exist" and therefore it would be illogical for "the class [to] include[] something that didn't exist . . ." Hr'g Tr. 23:25–24:1; 24:18–19 (emphasis added). Counsel's remarks, and the Court's questioning on this point, were thus clearly confined to *PACT* Section 8 housing—not Section 8 housing writ large. *See id.* at 24:13–19. As such, when placed in its proper context, the excerpt from NYCHA's counsel's remarks that Plaintiffs have highlighted was correct. And, in any event, the press release that Plaintiffs have attached as Exhibit C to their letter does not demonstrate that the PACT program existed at the time the Court certified the *Baez* class.

* * *

NYCHA reaffirms its appreciation for the Court's attention to this matter and continues to stand ready to provide any additional information the Court may request.

Respectfully submitted,

/s/ Gregory F. Laufer
Gregory F. Laufer

cc (via ECF): All counsel of record